



Philad., 27 Sept. 1846.

Dear Miss Dwight,

The hopelessly lost letters have been recovered — every one of which I have any knowledge. They came to hand on the 25<sup>th</sup> inst.; and I now acknowledge the receipt of your favour of <sup>the</sup> 10<sup>th</sup>, as also of Mr Dwight's of the 3<sup>rd</sup> ultimo. I am afraid that anything which I can now say will be too late; and yet I wish to make a few remarks on the remarkably lucid exposition of the views advocated by yourself and others which you have placed before me, in connexion with Mr Dwight's plan. If there were no difficulties in the way, I should prefer your idea, as I am sure Mr Dwight would; and if those difficulties can be removed, I would still prefer either of your plans to his. But I assume that they cannot be, when I say that the project of independent groups and individuals is much preferable to the total abandonment of any and every mode of associated life on however restricted a basis. From the first hour in which I have been honoured by a share in your councils, I have invariably and unceasingly and with sad prophecies ~~expressed~~ <sup>pressed</sup> the indispensable necessity of requiring each group, and each individual, to show that they were not pecuniary burthens to the institution. This result was to be attained by no offensive personalities, but <sup>by</sup> the organization of such a system of accounts and pecuniary compensations, as should show a weekly pecuniary result to the labour of each group and each individual. Mr Dwight's plan of compensating all the household groups by a stipulated payment is an illustration of what my plan was. At the time when this mode of operations was first talked of, it could readily have been carried into effect. You will perceive what a sense of responsibility would thus have been infused into the life of every individual — how it would have gently and certainly removed every incompetent person from among you, how it would



have prevented the admission of that sort of blind, half and divided knowl who have  
afflicted you and whose perhaps you cannot and exhausted you means, and have  
awakened an active regard to the fostering of ~~many~~ existing and the introduction of  
new and productive branches of industry. It was my opinion then, as it is now, that  
the task of spiritual and social work would have proved to be material excellence,  
and the ability to earn a livelihood. If you plan exclude this idea, I can only  
rejoice that I cannot give them my confidence. If they do, I see nothing wrong -  
habitable with the Dwight's view, in <sup>that</sup> ~~that~~ section of the people which you represent.  
You seem to think that Mr. Dakin, Mr. Dwight, &c. would refuse to accept the conduct  
and income of the school & that danger independently from the Chalmers, provided that  
the latter be under the direction of other individuals, & to the exclusion of the former.  
I cannot tell, without the local knowledge of the subject, I suspect otherwise. As the  
friends of these truly eminent individuals, I should urge their acceptance of  
such a proposition. I have long felt the claim of all heads too of them to some  
repose from the harassing & exhausting labors which I speak of which have  
not fallen to their share; and moreover I am and long have been certain that the  
school cannot be profitably and successfully conducted by individuals to whom any other  
important responsibility attaches. If then the citizenship & authorship required by the  
that danger be added to the management of the school, all the time and labor of those  
engaged in them must be exhausted. To the Association all large would be left the  
management & labor of all the material industry which it can profitably conduct.  
The households, in housing the school & that danger people, would be a successful  
industry. Other individual industries might doubtless be added now, and more would  
come. Let me not also forget that a handsome income would be derivable from  
visiting like myself. (I should mention here my application to the practice of  
receiving my visitors at Andover (whether they come or not) with any of the members or not)  
except for a fixed & unvarying compensation for board & lodging.) And now we come to



speck of the farm - a subject of great delicacy in the estimation of my fair friends  
Miss Dwight & Miss Burton. I affirm then my belief (from positive knowledge with ex-  
perience to one year's transacting) that the farm has never been otherwise than a very  
heavy loss to the institution. Of course I say nothing of this year's operations, which  
may and doubtless have been much more successful. Can you seriously make the  
farm pay its way? I confess my doubts. But I have not the least objection to ~~remedy~~  
~~the~~ a trial - provided that the means of making it are at hand. It would be enough  
for the respectable payers of the interest on the mortgage to part with it with you  
handy, unless they could receive a guarantee that the interest should be duly paid.  
But by the bargain of this sum might be shaken off by ~~the~~ letting such persons as you  
cannot entertain? I have been of success in this matter, because I have always  
understood, & thus borne witness, that the profit of a farm are but small &  
that its chief recommendation is the certainty of a livelihood which it affords, and I  
am provided that there be no mortgage on it. I do not think it very necessary or  
even very desirable that you should have a very able business man to conduct the  
various operations of business in a Phalanx. They shall need to require each person to  
be independent & responsible in its business management in substantial affairs, to  
certain fixed and universally applying laws of the whole body; whilst I should look  
to the accountant department to be applicable as the general harmonizer & arranger of  
the aggregate of business transactions. I never considered an ability as valuable ex-  
cept as the representation of the institution and of itself, and as the promoter of order &  
economy; and in those capacities I never saw any one so entirely fitted for the  
function as he. Always I considered it surprising that more should be expected from  
him; and where, by a general disposition to lean on him (as another Alvan created  
to support another world) a firm his own feeling that he must endeavor to do what no  
one else was competent or expected to do, some things have not been as well man-  
aged as they might & should have been, I have felt deep sympathy with him &





bestowed heavy reproaches elsewhere - mentally. It would give me the most exalted pleasure to see you making your attempt a triumphant fact; and if you can obtain the necessary funds for the effort, always provided that you feel rid of <sup>human</sup> ~~open~~ circumstances (I wish I could utter the last eight words with a speaking trumpet), I hope that you will be enabled to try it. I repeat that I cannot perceive any ground for believing that our literary friends will object to an arrangement which gives to those who labour intellectually the management of the intellectual pursuits, and to those who live by physical labour the direction of the material occupations. Your plan, after all, is the same as or nearly akin to Mr Dwigth's; because the separation which you propose would be only for a time - provided that success attend both sections. Again, hereafter, would you unite, when the sense & the worth of absolute pecuniary responsibility had <sup>caused</sup> both departments, and every member of each of them, to understand the true relation of one to the other. Once more, would Mr Ripley be President, when, and as his friend I say only when, his office should <sup>be</sup> unattended by the performance of duties which in other governments have required the time and ability of several men. But if your plan be impossible, because the difficulties in your section are insurmountable, then by all means rent the firm to a responsible individual, and fall back gladly on the admirable alternative which your brother advocates modified as he has proposed in a subsequent letter which I received from him. I understand it to be this: that the groups & individuals shall be pecuniarily responsible for their support; but that any surplus earned by any group shall be deposited in a general fund for general purposes. I have written with but little of hope to Mr Dwigth & Miss Benson on the subject of your future, because I had no information of your proceedings except in a most desponding letter from Mr Dana. I much wish that I had received you and Mr Dwigth's favours previously. I am rejoiced to hear so good an account of the school, & wish that pecuniarily it had been still better; and my parental anxieties



have been relieved by the information I receive of Abby's improvement. I observe gain  
in his letters to me; and it is only when I contrast his progress with even my ~~own~~  
at the same age, or measure the seeming unspanable gulf between his present condition  
and the ripe scholarship of Mr Dwight; that I become sorely disquieted. I am glad  
that at last you have some suitable companions for him. It has always been a  
puzzle to him that he had no playfellows; whilst there has been no want of the  
worst influences that ever surrounded children. I am curious to learn if these  
last have been abated & finally exorcised. It is not in place to remark here that  
I should scarcely fear that Mr Dwight's original plan would have consequences  
so deplorable as you reprobate. If by no other mode individual responsibility  
can be enforced, I would have it adopted at all hazards. It is your incapacity  
or unwillingness to dispose of burthensome individuals which has been one chief  
cause of your repeated & progressively more disastrous failures. The retention of  
such persons as Westcott, Chiswell & particularly the Whitehouse family has  
cost you thousands of dollars, and the loss of the confidence of the best friends  
of Association. But for this single vice, it is my impression that you would have  
been at this moment so prosperous that a Phalanx according to Fourier's own  
idea would have been in process of formation. And now, dear Miss Dwight, I  
confide to your kindness these speculations truly "born out of one season." I hope  
they will be of some little use to you. I wait much to hear what you are now  
doing. Will you not let me know? I hope to be with you before the 10<sup>th</sup> of  
October if some contingencies eventuate favorably. Please to present my best  
regards to your mother and sister, Mr Dwight, & may I not say Mr Davis? Will  
you tell Abby that I wrote to him yesterday, & forgot to inform him that there  
is or should be a parcel containing some books for him at the store or dwelling of  
Mr Haskins in Boston? I am

Sincerely your friend,

James Kay, Junr.